# Garff Constituency Debate

# Transcript

**Andy Wint**

Good evening, we’re in Garff tonight – Garff occupies the northeastern part of the Isle of Man. It’s made up of the local authority areas of Laxey, Lonan and Maughold, and includes the majority of Onchan parish and part of Howstrake from the old Onchan constituency. Notably, Garff was represented by Sir Charles Kerruish from 1946 until 1990, when he became the first president of Tynwald. Sir Charles was Speaker of the House of Keys from 1962 to 1990, a record term for anybody holding the office in any country in the British Commonwealth. So, our candidates have very big shoes to fill. The MHKs before the House of Keys was dissolved on the 12th of August were Daphne Caine and Martyn Perkin. Tonight, your prospective MHKs are: Daphne Caine, Martyn Perkins, Andrew Smith, Jamie Smith and Gareth Young. First of all, Gareth Young – why do you want to be MHK for Garth?

**Gareth Young**

Thanks Andy. The reason I want to stand for image is very simple I want to help people looking at the idea every day at school at the moment, but I want to help more people and this is the way to do it

**Jamie Smith**

I think I can bring balance to from my private sector experience but also for years as a golf commissioner, so I'd like to bring that balance to see smaller smarter government with more emphasis on frontline workers

**Andrew Smith**

I’ve always been passionate for the people of Garff. Having served through the Laxey commissioners have served the Isle of Man through treasury and I think to help the island through these next years.

**Martyn Perkins**

having been in government for last five years I know the bits of government that works and the bits of government that don't work and I believe there's a lot of unfinished business that I need to attend to in the next five years to benefit the people of Garff.

**Daphne Caine**

It's been a huge honour to represent the people of Garff for the last five years, but I think there is so much more to do. I've lobbied on behalf of constituents, I have challenged government I've brought legislation, I've amended legislation I think I've the skill set now my track record will show to do even more in the future.

**Andy Wint**

Much to talk about in the next hour live, here at the Shore in Laxey by the way! let's start off, first of all pump or dump sewage in Laxey Bay, Daphne Caine.

**Daphne Caine**

The answer is it must be pumped away to join the Irish scheme, that was what lacks was promised why should like second class citizens compared with Port Erin, Port St Mary. The original proposal to put an industrial unit in the middle of a heritage harbour a conservation area with a daily pump waggon travelling across the Isle of Man with the solids and a new bridge when we got all the issues of the flooding in the past, it just isn't workable. The best option and the best possible solution that Laxey deserves and that would benefit the whole island who loved to come to Laxey will be the pump away option and it hopefully combined with doing a sea wall across the promenade as well

**Andrew Smith**

I agree totally it's got to be pump rather than dump the only issue that I have is that the time scale for that to be actually installed leaves us with this continual sewage flow 24/7, so I think we've got to look at it is a two at least a two-pronged attack sort out the issues in the interim with a long term solution of definitely full support.

**Jamie Smith**

I was the chairman of Garff commissioners when the mansion cities plan application first came before us and there were several commissioners were on the fence and two of them were in favour of passing it I convinced them that we haven't had enough information from Manx Utilities about alternatives so yes I'm 100% for pumping, not dumping and I think the way to convince treasury is by looking at the whole of life costings over 80-100 years.

**Andy Wint**

And you think it's purely a matter of cost you think it's merely purely cost that it hasn't been done.

**Jamie Smith**

I think yes because Tim bold told Manx Utilities that now shout do the regional system so mentioned it is had no choice but to put forward the best solution within that constraint.

**Gareth Young**

So, I'm in agreement with the other candidates so far, which is definitely pumped not dump. We need to have clean bathing waters and we need to make sure that Laxey becomes that tourist destination for people and they're not going to come if we’re discharging raw sewage into the Bay. So we've gotta pump it away and not done.

**Martyn Perkins**

I absolutely agree with the comments made by the other concern candidates but I have a slightly different opinion that if we can possibly pump it all the way to Meary Veg and get Tynwald approva,l don't forget because they have ruled that we should dispose of it on a rural basis and not pumped through to Meary Veg. The fact that the treatment is not going to go ahead in the harbour now, we actually shot ourselves in the foot because we're going to have to find some way of getting that pumped through to Onchan and connected through to Meary Veg or we have to come up with some treatment place in between where we can actually treat it but the best for Laxey say that they don't want any effluent whatsoever going into the bay even if it's treated to modern standard. Now at this day and age the treatment facilities that are there guarantee that a very few carcinogenics and other bacteriophages and that going into the water, so we have to be pragmatic pumping all the way to the airport is not green at all. Even though we may use green energy it's going to take some time to get it organised we've gotta connect through Onchan so we need to keep our options open and give the Manx Utilities a good push to try and get something sorted out sooner rather than later.

**Andy Wint**

let's go to the green agenda and the government is committed to zero carbon by what 2030 Gareth Young, offshore, and onshore wind - what's your opinion?

**Gareth Young**

My preferences for offshore wind if you look at the kind of efficiencies of both options the offshore wind farms and much more efficient than onshore wind farms and they also have less impact for your local environment you could move them offshore and then they can generate somewhere in the region of about 20% more efficiently

**Andy Wint**

How serious would you be about a green agenda where you to become an MHK?

**Gareth Young**

Well one of the things that really frustrates me is seeing the can kicked down the road should we say so when the vote was to keep the net zero targets as 2050 instead of moving forward to 2035 I was exceptionally disappointed and I think we have to move that forward. We should fully commit to a green agenda because it will then increase our economy and allow us to then have a greener more sustainable island

**Andrew Smith**

I fully support win pal but I'd also like us to consider tidal and wave power. We have many bays on the Isle of Man and rivers that could easily utilise that type of power regarding green issues obviously I was the first one I think the only one to introduce biodiesel to the Isle of Man back in 2006. The only reason that that's not being successful in recent years is not that the diesel engines cannot run on biodiesel, but the diesel engine management systems tell it covenant on biodiesel so sadly despite all our efforts and we were collecting between 3500 and 4000 litres of cooking oil out of the waste stream every week to convert into biodiesel, and that was obviously so satisfying the government's reclaim re recycle reuse policy, we're unable to do that now because of the engine management

**Andy Wint**

Why do you think that makes government hasn't committed to E10 petrol?

**Andrew Smith**

I think there's a difficulty there because that is the way it has to be transported and they haven't got the pumping systems in the four course I understand, and I think the it is a big infrastructural disposition for them too they may look at it down the line but I think initially we have to be realistic that they can't do it now.

**Jamie Smith**

Whilst I’ll be willing to have onshore wind offshore I think is probably too expensive and unnecessary because of them we don't actually need that much similar to Andrew I'm suggesting that we keep a watching brief on the tidal and wave that particular tidal technologies that coming in up in the Orkneys is something that's just gone in and looks successful, mean time we can do some short term solar panel and public buildings - encouraging bus travel free for under 22s and the services and short term things we can do on the green agenda whilst we keep a watching brief and I suspect we won't go wind power I suspect will go title

**Martyn Perkins**

I believe that we should have onshore wind power we've got windy corner let's put a couple of big turbines up there and to make the use of it. I've actually visited Orkney and I've seen how they use the wind power at night when the public aren't using power and they use the excess power to electronic water to produce hydrogen. They have hydrogen vehicles that are being used and of course they produce just water at the end of the day the filling stations are very much like a petrol station so you're not having to leave your car on charge for many hours. You've got a range of three or 400 miles from one charge and the green cars that we have at the moment, the electricity isn't that green because it's actually coming from fossil fuels. So, we really need to move that on and go more of wind power than we possibly can.

**Daphne Caine**

We're in the middle of a climate emergency and the rate of global warming is accelerating, so yes we must do something and we are so far behind everybody else. It is extremely frustrating that this government this administration has had consultation after consultation and not committed to all the infrastructure that we need to benefit future generations. To not only enhance our international reputation by doing our bit for the environment, but actually bringing down bills and making it a cleaner better island for us and for future generations

**Andy Wint**

The government is pushing an open door most people understand what the problem is most people understand the technologies around things like solar panels, ground source heat pumps and what have you - why do you think government seems reluctant to push something intangible through?

**Daphne Caine**

I have no idea I think the environment department the minister have completely failed their brief on this. The fact that we're still building dozens of houses hundreds of houses with oil and gas boilers, mainly gas at the minute when we know they're going to have to be retrofitted - why are we not having sustainable housing for the future? Yes, we need better transport if you've got solar panels you can power your car your electric car sustainably and also why are government buildings not leading the way by them go going green and putting solar panels and other things in.

**Andy Wint**

Ok, Daphne Caine - should the Isle of Man accept Afghan refugees?

**Daphne Caine**

I think the Isle of Man it should investigate whether that's a possibility. We are talking with all the issues we've got on the Isle of Man we're talking about people who have been or under threat or being killed, if I was in Afghanistan as a female politician I would be shot or at risk of disappearing. The other point about it is these days I've read about girls finishing their university degree they're having to burn their jeans, their brother’s going out to buy them a burka they have no future in public life any career prospects and if they speak up about it or protest and hats off to the women who were protesting and during this week - they risk death not only to themselves but to their families. Absolutely, if the Isle of Man could accommodate them if we could investigate if that is a feasible respect for the island then yes I would welcome Afghan refuges.

**Andrew Smith**

The difficulty is obviously I'm in the frontline with working with Salvation Army and the food bank and housing matters. We have got numerous people in our island desperately requiring accommodation, requiring a stable life just because. You may remember Ted Ball and his whiskey bottle, it used to be under the Villa Marina arcades just because that gentleman and sadly is passed away just because they know the people in high profile - everybody thinks that the matters gone away from the Isle of Man. The reality is reality is that we are struggling daily to find enough bed nights for our own people

**Andy Wint**

So we should look after our own first?

**Andrew Smith**

I quite agree we should look after their own first.

**Jamie Smith**

We are wealthy nation, lots of us have benefited from that over the years and we can't cherry pick these things if we wanted a seat at the top table of nations then we have to do our bit and we can't cherry pick. So, a small number and I'm talking about only perhaps five or ten families. Yes, we need to make sure that we've got sufficient translators and the support for them and yes there are problems we have in it with our own people and that doesn't mean that they're going to be any further down the queue. We need to look after everyone, and we need to accept a few refugees

**Andy Wint**

you think for our own international reputation?

**Jamie Smith**

I think it's exactly what we should be doing from a humanitarian point of view yes

**Martyn Perkins**

If you ask on the street people just do not want to have Afghan refugees. I think they feel that the waiting list for medical treatment and for housing, that Andrew has identified, would prohibit them. On the other hand that we need to do our bit for our international status I agree with Jamie. The problem is do we allow five families to win the lottery when the rest of them still stuck where they are? I believe that we need to keep our international fund for international aid going, because that gives injections to people and helps a vast load of people more than we could ever have five here but yes I think if we could manage 5 families that would be the way to go.

**Gareth Young**

We are per capita like one of the richest countries in the world. And the fact that we have homelessness and people who run a food bank and things like that is pretty shameful in reality, when you've got 20% of the population living below the poverty line. However, that is not an issue that should actually dictate whether or not we have refugees come to the Isle of Man. The western world has been had its hand in the cookie jar of countries for decades and decades. 20 years of Afghan occupation is what the West has had. There are hundreds of thousands of people that have helped western troops with translations, fought alongside them died alongside them, and then when we pull out without any real warning, and without any real structure behind it and then we turn round to them and say sorry you're not good enough to come here that's just not acceptable.

**Andy Wint**

Should the Isle of Man give .7% of GDP as international aid as recommended by the UN?

**Gareth Young**

Yes

**Jamie Smith**

Just trying to do the maths but yes I think so

**NB:** All candidates agree with this statement

**Daphne Caine**

I agree with that but I think it would have to be step by step. I don't think we can jump right up there it would be a really good target to have them

**Andy Wint**

Ok I want to go with talk to Gareth Young now it works with young people as a teacher, how do you get young people engaged in politics? We have 16-year-olds and statistically they are the least likely to vote. How do you make a 16-year-old vote?

**Gareth Young**

You have to hook them somehow you have to make them realise the fact that the people that are sitting here are helping to determine their future you have to give them a reason that they actually want to get involved and actually interested in what's going on. You make it personal to them you talk to them about it you go into the schools you engage with them. The last time I saw a politician in school? I can't remember

**Andy Wint**

In your curriculum is there anything about Manx politics?

**Gareth Young**

History definitely - very little in terms of politics. I'm assigned specialist so I don't really deal with it. We do couch some of our science lessons in terms of what you would see on the Isle of Man, but not in terms of history and politics.

**Martyn Perkins**

I don't think we should hook them in and drag them in screaming because I will put them off straight away.

**Gareth Young**

That’s not water hook is… a hook is a reason to actually do it….

**Martyn Perkins**

I took it literally right Gareth, we have to get them interested. I can't remember the last group of children that came round Tynwald this year. I think it's been difficult with covered and what have you but we used to have a lot of 15 year olds and 60 year olds coming round, showing them the chambers and they actually had a junior Tynwald with the debating society in. I think we've covered again that hasn't happened but that used to generate a lot of interest

**Daphne Caine**

I've been talking to young people on the doorstep some of them not yet young and old enough to vote in this election they are very engaged. When it's relevant to people in terms of how much student debt or the fact of a student debt is determined by the politicians that you put making those policies, when the amount of pre-school cost is determined by the policies, the whole family income and family outcomes depends on the decisions that politicians are taking. I found some - particularly this this last term - the extinction rebellion the mount of knowledge and awareness among young people because it's their future that we are influencing at the moment - I find them very engaged. But I think the actual structure of parliament and how they go to vote, that hasn't perhaps being covered the colour cultural and history of the Isle of Man could I think be much more in schools. I've had several times, not in the Covid years, but previously several sessions in schools talking to young students and particularly about the Syrian refugee issue and when students bold petition. I think a lot of students are very engaged in world affairs an Isle of Man affairs but it's the mechanism of how they actually go out and vote.

**Jamie Smith**

There are lots of kids who are politicians they're sitting on school councils from reception years onwards they just don't realise it's the same sort of politics. As they step up, there's a gap between being a school council person and then commissioners and politicians and if we can close that gap by perhaps having extending the youth parliament to have more localised youth parliaments, almost like a youth commissions. That would be brilliant because as Daphne said it's their future that we're basically fighting for here and I've had the pleasure of working with the island's youngest commissioner, young Liam was end 18 when he was getting one, he is absolutely brilliant and his knowledge of things like planning was at least as good as anybody else's of met.

**Andrew Smith**

I think that we should encourage image case from time to time to actually visit schools and explain about politics and the issues that are facing them. In addition I'm very fortunate on my campaign that I've got a youngster who is studying politics across and I've got him on my shoulder the doorstep, so he can he can hear the what the public are asking and he can hear my response. And if he wishes that you can interact on that so I think that is a practical way of helping youngsters.

Andy Wint

All this has to be paid for so how do we re-float the economy how do we recover and how do we raise the money to pay for everything that the candidates are talking about, Jamie Smith?

**Jamie Smith**

So we need to lead first from government. There needs to be a bit of emphasis, we need want to see government departments putting business cases for their following year budget rather than just assuming they're going to get the same budget and this thing about using up your budget which we've heard around the island other places that you use it up in order to get it next year it should be the opposite. It should be have to put a business case So we start from government and then the word is confidence. Businesses come, jobs come if there's an economic confidence and is confident that government will back them up so when business people come here hoping to set up a business we need to exceed their expectations and that is the sort of environment, the atmosphere that will encourage them.

**Andy Wint**

Do you think there's not been happening?

**Jamie Smith?**

I think it hasn't been happening enough and I think they see, the government hasn't been in some ways being a frustration rather than an assistance.

**Daphne Caine**

I think the Isle of Man has bounced back pretty well actually from Covid we have 1.8 billion pounds of reserves which is higher than it was five years ago. Alf Cannon’s treasury minister has gone out for a £400 million debt issue. There's a lot of interest in it is absolutely the right thing to do to refinance debt, hold onto our reserves and fund the future. Within my role of department for enterprise I have seen first hand the efforts that are going on both supporting the businesses that we have on the island and expanding the sector, and within the digital sector the hundred jobs new jobs have been delivered this year so far with 100 more projected before the end the year and a pipeline of 800. So, there are plenty of efforts especially through the locate.im portal where we've had 400 education professionals put in for their register their interest for jobs on the Isle of Man. There is a huge amount of interest going on. I'm not saying it's perfect the main thing I think we need to do is stop the waste. Streamline government and stop the waste of the millions on the capital projects that are going way over budget.

**Martyn Perkins**

I think one of the things we have to do is to get the economy back on its feet it has recovered to a certain extent. But we do have to have Plan B because going forward it's going to be very different scenario that we've had over the last few years with Brexit and the Covid that different threats coming from there. We have to get the politicians out and about shaking hands and telling people where the Isle of Man. Playing the Isle of Man are not consistently moaning about the shortfalls of the Isle of Man that we hear all the time on Mannin Line and various other places. Talk the island up because we have got a good story to tell concentrate on bringing new business to the island. You do that by showing the bosses are quality of life and how they can grow their business if they come to the Isle of Man, and what a good place for business the Isle of Man. And also not for getting food and drink which is coming up next weekend. We've got a fantastic story to tell about food and drink which was underline during Covid when people bought a lot of local stuff.

**Andrew Smith**

Definitely agree with the previous comments that we've got to boost the economy and yes bye formatting bye alone is part of the way. But also I think that the previous or the current Home Affairs minister Cregine is also already intimated that they may be looking at a 10% corporate tax rate, obviously with zero ten at the moment. But many multinational corporates need and want to pay tax. Consequently, they would be it would be an incentive for them to come to the Isle of Man and pay 10%, which will bring their mind and management here. Which would obviously their investment will be here they will be employing a small group of people there, which would also put ISFP into the system.

**Gareth Young**

So what the other candidates said is absolutely spot on in terms of boosting the economy and creating jobs and naturally bringing wealth to the island. But also on top of that I think the Isle of Man as a government needs to generate on wealth for the people. If we die the vest into green energy, in kind of four different phases where you're establishing renewables so that we overproduce electricity which can then sell in order to generate further wealth. I think that kind of business model as well going forward over the years would be viable for us as well.

**Andy Wint**

OK I want to come to education now and the quality of makes education, Daphne Caine

- do you think children let's put aside the people that are going to university. The ones who don't go to university, Chamber of Commerce reported they were disappointed - they had they had difficulty in placing for the children who came out of schools.

**Daphne Caine**

There is a need to match the skills that young people are leaving school with or college to the jobs that are available in the workplace and there are lots of jobs and there are a lot of interesting challenging and entertaining jobs that we want young people to be retaining staying on the Isle of Man and also attracting others to the Isle of Man. So, there's a huge amount of work going into making available courses not only for young people but actually lifelong learning and people reskilling in their later years like 50s or older to enable them to take up the really exciting jobs there are out there.

**Garth Young**

So currently in education we have quite a substantial amount of work going into skills based curriculum development. What we're trying to do is teach students skills that we they can then apply in the workplace. The thing is, we also have to then teaching those skills that they can apply to an exam. All of their kind of great and everything in determined by how well they can pass a written paper at the end of year 11 or the end of year 10, that determines almost how good they actually are, and we know that's wrong.

**Andy Wint**

Do you think sometimes there are people there are students who will be very good vocationally or with apprenticeships, they get railroaded into exams they don't really want to take.

**Garth Young**

Without a doubt like we have a very rigid system at the moment. We rely on examples in the UK and from that we are like we dictate what they're able to do. If they allow those skills to be developed and apprenticeships and things like that, they would be much better off.

**Andrew Smith**

Definitely agree that we should give them more life skills at school because obviously not everyone that all children don't learn at the same speed and we've got to cater for everybody. Just as you mentioned there we need to give them more vocational skills so will come out with a craft. I mean you get school children at school now I've changed allowable or wire plug. I mean that is basic for because I'm going to start some people start of family very soon after leaving school so they need basic this basic life skills as well as all the education they already get.

**Martyn Perkins**

I think going back to the days of engineering apprenticeships, which is one of my fortes – I was in aviation aerospace engineering - and I think the way you get youngsters like that interested. You get them in work experience, and get the right careers advice at school I think we must have to try get the youngsters for what they're able to do then what actually switches them on. And make sure the employers give them work experience. In that way the student finds out whether the employer is what they want, and also the other way round.

**Andy Wint**

Are we training enough engineers on the Isle of Man?

**Martyn Perkins**

At the moment I think the engineering has had a bit of a hard time, because nobody is building aircraft. Now we have to diversify that as part of our economy and look elsewhere. I've got a feeling that it's going to be a long time before you ever get Airbus to recover the numbers that they've had before. But they can build other things. We should be looking at cancer equipment medical equipment all that type of stuff.

**Jamie Smith**

As a father of two teenagers are well know that when we get to 16 some kids are just weary of school. They done 12 years university isn't for them, they just want to leave school get a job and there should be apprenticeships and internships and there should be training for them in the in the when they are 15 and 16 for perhaps running a small business, doing the basic books doing - knowing what they have to do as far as health and safety and things like that. So we need to prepare that those kids who won't go to university for doing that and I do think that it's, Martyn said, there is things that the green energy there can be some economic improvements for example - building solar panels and air source heat pumps. It would be ideal for the islands and that's the way I’d like to see that.

**Andy Wint**

I'm going to go very quickly around the candidates now before we open the floor to the audience here at the Shore in Laxey. I'm going to ask two questions about recreational and medicinal cannabis - are you four or against medicinal and recreational cannabis?

**Andrew Smith**

For medicinal, against recreation.

**Jamie Smith**

For medicinal and probably for recreational, though it does need to be looked into carefully. I certainly don't want to see young kids getting a criminal record for possession of two grammes.

**Gareth Young**

Like Jamie’s just said. Definitely for medicinal use, and decriminalisation of cannabis and then a consultation to see whether or not recreational should be legalised.

**Andy Wint**

Can you see at any point in the future recreational cannabis being completely legal on the Isle of Man?

**Gareth Young**

I think if we have the right consultation, and the right evidence that shows us that it is the will of the people, and the benefits outweigh any side effects then yes.

**Daphne Caine**

I'm for medicinal cannabis I think that we now have the ability to have prescriptions in terms of recreational cannabis I think I would like to see an immediate stop for any people being prosecuted for low level possession. I think that if you read the chief constable's annual reports over the past five years, constantly there is a theme - a million pounds of drugs a month is traded on the Isle of Man and it is through into International Criminal gangs and that is putting pressure on families and 28 juveniles up from 1, 10 years ago. 28 juveniles were prosecuted for delivering drugs - so yes absolutely it needs a rethink it needs a public consultation. It would need careful control. If so many other countries and states are managing to legalise cannabis - why wouldn't the Isle of Man?

**Martyn Perkins**

Very much for medical cannabis, very disappointed that only two doctors on the Isle of Man actually prescribe it. I think there's a wealth of opportunity there to relieve people suffering. Recreational cannabis, I think it should be legalised with certain conditions and we should actually supply it with production of our medical cannabis, but supply in a manner in which we know the strength is limited to its sale to people. The government should tax it and it, and it should be limited to consumption in people’s houses and nowhere else. The rest of the world is jumping on this opportunity and I feel we should do the same after consultation with everybody.

**Andy Wint**

Manx Radio tonight is live in the constituency of Garff. We are talking to the candidate that are: Daphne Caine, Martyn Perkins, Andrew Smith, Jamie Smith and Gareth Young. There are what they used to call requisition meetings, they’re now called pre-election meetings. The next one is on Tuesday the 14th of month next Tuesday at Onchan primary school from 7 till nine, so we're now going to go to the audience at the Shore in Laxey.

**Keith Watterson**

What is your view on progressing an all island rating system as presently there are local authorities who are very affluent such as Malew and Braddan for example - because of the commercial properties in their area like the airport and the hospital?

**Jamie Smith**

All island for commercial rates absolutely, all island for domestic no. There's a very good reasons why that is regional but I do think that the 21 local authorities desperately need to work together cooperate because otherwise we will they will go up and will end up with a north South East and West plus Douglas.

**Martyn Perkins**

Commercial rate, absolutely all island. But domestic rates, some people only have one teller to lamp post in the whole of the street. I think we have to look island wide about how we equalise it to actually get a fair deal for the people. Some people get more things and others. Some people have access to Ramsey swimming pool for example. I know a lot of Garff people use that. So there is a work to be done not just on the size of houses, which also should be included as part of the revamp of the rates - but also the public facilities that are supplied.

**Andrew Smith**

Definitely in favour of all island commercial rates and I would also favour equalisation of local government rates.

**Daphne Caine**

I think this is an issue that to many governments have failed to tackle and it is well overdue. Because the number of local authorities and the way their structured is costing people more money to deliver services they even waste collection then it would do if it was done in a more joined up way. But I do support the fact that everyone should pay equal water rates, because the water is the cost of delivering team drinking water to each home. But in terms of the other rate, I think when we have efficient local authorities who deliver services to their community - then why should we be merged with a more expensive administration of another one. We need to get down to what services we want, how many local authorities to deliver and go from there.

**Gareth Young**

I'd say I'd be definitely in favour of an all island commercial rate because I think that would work well. Like Daphne said I think we need to make sure that the way that properties and rateable values are done needs to be completely rethought changed

**Aaron Craigie**

Good evening, this week we've seen very hurried introduction in the UK of and you social care system. What are the dates opinions on - if there's a need to raise more income for government where they support raising it on National Insurance, i.e. just on workers and not people who are deriving their income from other sources? Secondly the cap on so lifetime social care costs being introduced in the UK, would you extend it to here?

**Martyn Perkins**

I think that the cap on social cost is a good one. It’s unfair to get people to sell houses too for their elderly care. I do think that it is rather a high tax on workers, a bit unfair because they're the guys that are actually getting their sleeves rolled up and producing the wealth that we have. One thing I do feel about National Insurance, is in particular in the Isle of Man, we have a lot of wealthy people that actually employ carers. Now they actually pay National Insurance on those carers wages because they are employers. I don't think that's very it's almost like a double taxation. I tackled off Alf Cannon in the last administration about this unfortunately we couldn't get a way forward but I think that that is one particular issue that needs addressing.

**Gareth Young**

So I think the increase in the burden on just workers is not right I think we need to actually think about that going forward properly because we have got significant amounts of waste within government, where if we're wasting continuously then we need to actually streamline that first before we then start asking for more money from the public. So, initially the way the social care reforms are going in the UK the cap the cap is definitely a good thing - but it doesn't include things like rent, food, heating, electricity anything like that so that £86,000 is being banded about that is only for the care side of things you can still be charged £4000 a month of rent uncapped so at that point there a cap is great but it's got to be actually thought through and not surreptitiously brought about to just touch one side of things.

**Jamie Smith**

Most of us will have seen a presentation which shows that Garff’s demographics is one of the oldest on the island and is a really hot topic on the doorstep. People are really worried about losing their savings through having to do 24 hour care so we need to bring these in I wouldn't put it on National Insurance or income tax, although it might have to be harsher National Insurance but the key thing is it needs to be ring fence so that the people paying it from both National Insurance from their wealth I understand that it's going purely for health and social care. I think that is probably fair for the working people but you also need some mechanisms to take it from the people who have a lot of wealth and less income.

**Daphne Caine**

I think the Isle of Man is already 1% below on National Insurance than the UK and this would put us 2.25% below and yes I would support and looking at an increase National Insurance to fund social care on the basis of it being capped but it needs to be among solution for the Manx problem. I think that there's also with the government having KPMG commissioned to do a major tax and economic strategy review for the island, that potentially corporation tax, potentially income tax - nothing is off the table in terms of what is the best tax and economic model for the Isle of Man for the future. I think I think that we have to look at all these things for the benefit of the community and to establish fairness and get rid of those inequalities that we see in society that caused so much disruption.

**Andrew Smith**

Definitely because obviously it on the other hand we know we've got autonomy and that's when we should use autonomy. If we need to raise national insurers or if we need to raise taxes that is our will but we need to do it in in a holistic way to ensure it's for the benefit of the Manx people.

**Mark Buttery**

It’s on sewage, we’ve swam in it, we’ve eating it – especially in Peel and I've been ill through it so here's the question so if the question. If the MUA use the the so called local sewerage plants the IRBCs which were destined for Laxey, luckily the planning overturned it, so the affluent from these IRBCs is still discharged into the bay of Laxey and Garwick. These plans although this screen the plastics… would the MHKs agree my grandson should not have to paddle in someone else's waste product?

**Andrew Smith**

I've already declared my position is that I want to put it I want to pump it to Port Jack, connected to the pipe so there's nothing actually likes absolutely nothing zero zilch what else all word you want to say it in Laxey Bay. You need to canvas the people if you get the people behind you then the people through the MHK makes the policy so get the I'm a great believer in people power people power led by a strong leader.

**Jamie Smith**

My concern with the treated solution is that it meets the 2006 EU rules, but they are by definition 15 years old and probably if we haven't had a pandemic in the EU we may well have had updated water standard rules coming from the EU already. We are close enough -those rules go out 100 or 200 miles so Ireland has say in the Manx waters so that's why we need to pump, and if you're going to follow up with a question about how the two Garff MHKs do that it's a question of going with treasury and explaining that over 80 and 90 years it, does make economic sense to pump not to have these waggons and the drivers daily.

**Martyn Perkins**

You will have the waggons and drivers if you pump you still have to take the solids out of the sewage to actually pump it. It's not going to go the big IRCBs are not going to go in harbour we know that's been established by the planning however…

**Andy Wint**

IR…?

IRBCs is corrected from the panel…( Rotating biological contactor)

**Martyn Perkins**

Whatever is rotating biologically yeah the rotating biological treatments we're not going to have that by the harbour but you're still going to have to have pumping you're still going to have to have screening and you're still going to have to have ultraviolet treatment in flood conditions where it overflows. Now these IRCBs can produce very clean water, and they are worldwide in their usage. Now, they comply completely with the 2006 requirements. And yes as technology goes on in your 18 years it's going to change – 80 years ago we still awesome cards as technology moves on they will produce clean water even better than the stuff that is being produced now.

**Daphne Caine**

Yes I completely support going to the pump way option joining iris it's true that we would still need to get wagonloads of solid. But we reduce it to once a week instead of six or seven times a week. In terms of the renewable energy that would potentially come online it has to be if we think of ourselves and we celebrate the biosphere I'm looking for a sustainable future in the best way possible to deal with the waste, then it has to be that the pump away option would benefit Laxey bay, Garwick bay and all the people of the island and visitors

**Andy Wint**

When would you like to see Laxey stop swimming in sewage?

**Daphne Caine**

Tomorrow.

**Gareth Young**

So pumping away is longevity wise the best option by a country mile. It's cheaper in the long run because if we're looking at a high density polythene pipe day last for 100 years in the ground. In comparison the IRBCs they would require replacing every 15 to 25 years, at a cost of millions of pounds every single time. So it gives up yes but the pumps are considerably cheaper than I'll IRBC at £500,000 per unit - whereas a pumping unit - you looking at 12,000 pounds for apartment

**Alisson Harvey**

No one has addressed the last administration's waste of our money is taxpayers the prom is overtime over budget, Liverpool dockers overtime over budget, the increase in the number of civil servants, the increase in the civil servants wage bill, pension hole MHKs pensions - how are you going to stop our money being frittered away?

**Garth Young**

So if any contract comes through government it needs to actually be scrutinised properly so for example the landing stage where we had the news reports that the negotiators were just completely outclassed and then instead of costing Liverpool landing stage yes yes so instead of the cost being minimal it's spiralling upwards 250 50 million plus. S o I think we need to actually make sure that when we go into these things these negotiations - it's not really government money is the taxpayers money - it's everybody's money who's paying taxes our money that's going wasted. When capital spends go over - you just have at the school projects £11 million over budget - it wasn't finished.

**Daphne Caine**

Yes, it does come up on the doorstep a lot and I'm angry about the waste of money because of the benefits the community if we had those millions to spend on other policies. The key thing the department the treasury had a demons management review of the department of infrastructure, and that they told them what we already all knew which is that - they lack competency in project management. Treasury promises in the February budget that we were going to get capital projects unit that - we need that proper competence in looking at a project and properly managing and costing it from the get go. We haven't had that and the fact that all these things are spiralling out of control is terrible, I mean it's making the Isle of Man look ridiculous and it loses all credibility in terms of delivering it for the future. The other aspect of the question about the increased of staff numbers, well a lot of those of the medical appointments for Covid response, for border force and other things that the point being that we need to revisit the single legal entity committee that's one public service report - streamline government to do deliver policy and that operational things move outside the government. Governments got to stop doing so much.

**Andrew Smith**

Everything that the question I hear on the doorstep. I say obviously is accountability and not only accountable its governance but why is it that all the MHKs of the previous administration are all say they can't do anything about it. When they're actually in power to shape what was happening - how come the promenades been overspent so much? Liverpool landing stages is still a piece of dirt? We haven’t got anything to see for the money why is it the blaming who are trying to blame this well I want to know.

**Jamie Smith**

There is a perception that government departments work in silo mentality empire building not cooperating we need to have these senior managers in government are paid equitably with private sector they need to have performance management so school cards that rate them on better cooperation across departments better service delivery reduction in costs and as an example as Daphne said, the capital project team is absolute essential. It should be headcount neutral pulling legal people and project management people from other departments they should be that team that runs contracts, has late running penalties.

**Andy Wint**

You think department head should be accountable in terms of marks against them?

**Jamie Smith**

Yes, that that that their remuneration should be based on commensurate with commercial on it yes it absolutely because they can pay that sort of level but they the services and they should be looking at reducing expense is which doesn't mean redundancies it probably means natural wastage - like an overhead containment bonus.

**Martyn Perkins**

I agree that the civil servant hated department should be totally accountable and, not just financially they should be actually measured with KPIs and if they don't come up to scratch they should be sent down the road like any private company. The reason that we've actually had more people employed is as definitely says Covid, and track and trace was a typical one and various other things. One of the problems is the public one services - but for example the planning - people that come out to see you have been reduced dramatically because of the reduction in head numbers. And then everybody starts moaning nobody's come out to look at my plans for 8-10-12 weeks.

**Andrea Bartlett**

My question is from a business perspective, we're a small island which means a small talent pool. How do we attract enough external experience to help improve our internal intellectual bandwidth?

**Jamie Smith**

So I think this is one of those things which is not pigeonholed like the media want to say it's either education or health, it's one of those things where everything's intertwined. You want to have a better a lovely place to live where she currently is, slightly better is a 1% improvement here 1% improvement there the sports coaches say that's how you how you improve it - they then compound so you make housing more available, you make health lesson waiting lists people then want to come here, people then once start jobs here and people want to do those jobs at those companies are starting so - it's a it's an integrated thing.

Gareth **Young**

So like Jamie said it is quite integrated with making the island of more desirable place to actually come to but also we need to hold onto our own talent and it's a case of making our brightest and best want to stay on the Isle of Man. We need to encourage them to do that we need to encourage them back from university and improve ourselves as well as attracting new talent pool. You could go down a simple route of providing them with free University place on the premise that they will come back and work on the Isle of Man for five years. The current system where they would repay their fees which would kick in is if there if they did stay in the UK to do that, however I think that would actually encourage quite a lot students to up take on that because when you sat when you're saddled with £50,000 plus that it's a very harsh start imposition.

**Andrew Smith**

If we if we look at the cross section of industry and obviously we got to diversify and we're going to recognise what students actually going away to train for and to integrate those two things together so that we've got the industries for them to come back because no good developing things the students are going away to train for and they can’t come back so there is a is a dichotomy there that we need to address and obviously that has the holistic approach.

**Daphne Caine**

I think we have to encourage innovation and that means accepting an element of risk which governments have been very risk averse and yet still managed to lose millions in other ways but I have one of the ideas outlined in my manifesto not mine but feel from feedback listening to industry. If government built a faculty of a university marine sciences let's replace the university that we had at the Port Erin marine biological station, there are so many doctors still on the island working who graduated from there or did their masters there. We've got the marine environment, we could have a centre of excellence for a Scandinavian university and have lower cost of living here or a university from America or Oxbridge or anywhere - but if they had the faculty and student accommodation we would have such vibrancy on the Isle of Man. It would be the place to go and then a certain percentage up to 30% of them would be able to find employment on the Isle of Man, I think that would rejuvenate the island.

**Martyn Perkins**

Yes it's all about retaining graduates 50% of graduates don't come back which is Natalie horrendous figure we do have to provide a vibrant economy that with jobs that they can actually progress when they when they come out of their qualifications, and also develop their personal qualifications going forward. The main problem we have to tackling the other side of your question is bringing people into run Manx things. Which is what I think you alluded to start off with - it's a very fine line because you want people that have grown up with the whatever it is department there in but you also want somebody that much detached to be able to dictate what is going to be happening or get people round to understand what's going to be happening. And it's a fine line because, we've had this with the post office we've had it with various other government departments - and it is a very difficult question. It all hinges on getting the right personnel in the right place at the right time.

**Francesca Di Haven**

A lot of time money seems to be lost by government departments that pull in different directions, how can we overcome silo mentalities and empire building to encourage more joined up government?

**Jamie Smith**

I think it's just through convincing them that is in their interests and that they will get congratulated for doing that rather than building empire building and that is for us to set earlier for a more of a private sector mentality toward for performance management.

**Daphne Caine**

I'm not certainly got the right structure of government to suit the modern and future community needs so perhaps a review looking at the single legal entity committee report recommendations the one public service. We've got to get a streamline government that is a fair efficient for the services we want to provide now and I think we need to look at government stopping doing so much so that the policy focuses much tighter with everybody working together.

**Gareth Young**

Like Daphnejust said I don't think we've got the right structure at the moment to be able to do that effectively and we need to review it and we need to streamline our services in order to stop that waste and we need to reward people like Jamie said for actually working together effectively for the benefit of everybody.

**Martyn Perkins**

During Covid there was a great cooperation right across departments. I'll give you one example was the fact that we didn't have any hand cleaner. And, we had to make it on the island we had to certify it for public use and make sure it was safe and actually got back to the public. The office Fair Trading believe it or not coordinated everything right across government from the government for an analyst and the Fynoderee gin people and we did tremendous job. Now if we can maintain that, get rid of some of the red tape focus on what we want to be doing that is I believe how we should do it. One of the things I said on the Laxey flooding - we need one group of people that are responsible for all the flooding and the river walls the telling people that there is going to be bad weather forecasts coming up and it needs to be in one place and that is actually what they've done is now in the DOI which is very useful. People get a text when the weather is bad we know it's going to happen and that is one example of how to get it to work.

**Andrew Smith**

I'm just worried that we've continued now talking bout we've already add restructured movement we've already talked about silo mentality in early Alan Bell’s days so why are we talking about the silo mentality is still there or we need to restructure government because restructuring government costs money. I'm sick to death of hearing everyone talking all this rubbish about restructuring and wanting another, why do we not just work together because we are very passionate about the Isle of Man. Everyone put their shoulder to the wheel, let's get the economy on track and forget the difference.

**Jamie Smith**

They shouldn't have needed a pandemic said work together.

**Andy Wint**

OK now comes the time of the evening ladies and gentlemen were here in the constituency of Garff when every candidate will have one minute for their pitch to you the voter first of all in reverse alphabetical order, Gareth Young.

**Gareth Young**

That was a bit of a shock I thought we were going the other way right so why am I the best candidate when I look at my public service history and my passion for improving things and helping people I'm at the forefront. I've lived through the problems that the Isle of Man sees on a day to day basis and I deal with the problems on a day to day basis. At work I would have 200 - 220 people that I would be responsible for their pastoral care, their social issues and health and well being in all of those kinds of bits and pieces - I want to expand that to the rest of the Isle of Man and why I want to be an MHK is because I want to actually improve things for everybody. I believe I can do that because I'm driven passionate and at the end of the day I have the drive to succeed.

**Jamie Smith**

I'm not a seasoned politician, but I am a part-time voluntary commissioner and with private sector experience. I'm trying to bring ideas to the table, so I'm looking to bat with a housing association. I'd like to see a voice in government which is not just from whole of infrastructure but someone with infrastructure who is a the voice of roads and road users, so like a junior highways minister. I think we have some really tough funding decisions on the health side, and I'd like to see this capital projects team that has been touted about and we don't even know it's going to be in Treasury or Cabinet Office or department of infrastructure - think it probably should be in treasury and I'd like to see that done as soon as possible.

**Andrew Smith**

I've always demonstrated a passion for Manx politics since I arrived working the commissioners working in Isle of Man gov treasury running for the by election 1995 running for election last time in 2016, and I hopefully in everything that's happened in the run up to this election - people will realise that I am passionate about the Garff on the Isle of Man is people. I'm passionate about the well-being, the welfare and I want to see an island that could be utopia. It's a case of us working together. I believe that I'm the passionate to do that. I believe that I've got the skills. I believe that you'll see through my demeanour that I'm interested unconvinced I can do it.

**Martyn Perkins**

Having been in government for the last five years I've experienced the ups and downs of successful government and where government has failed. I believe that I've done my apprenticeship and put my shoulders to the wheel and help things move forward particularly with Covid. Going forward we're going to have some have some very big challenges with the economy with the health service and with the education of our young people. It's essential we get it right is essential we keep the island together and the government has to bring the population with it, keep them informed and bring back confidence in the electorate. I believe I can do that. If you think you can align with my thinking I would appreciate your vote on the Election Day, thank you.

**Daphne Caine**

My vision for the Isle of Man is to become a beacon of sustainable living with affordable homes and increased environmental awareness. A place that harnesses a variety of renewable energy generation and becomes a centre of educational excellence, attracting graduates to return and study here. A place with exciting very job opportunities where entertainment and outdoor activities abound, and with fair taxation supporting services for the most vulnerable and removing inequalities from the youngest to the elderly. That was from my manifesto that I think most people have had delivered today - I would say add hard I am a mother a wife a resident of the Isle of Man. I want to make the Isle of Man a better place for my children and for the future generations. I think I have the tenacity, the challenge, the insight, the knowledge and the skills I'm a track record that will show I'm not afraid to challenge and I'm ready to step up represent the people of Garff for the benefit of everybody.

**Andy Wint**

OK we've got a spare minutes I want to go round each candidate what would you say to someone who hasn't voted hitherto, how would you urge them to vote?

**Daphne Caine**

I would say look at what's out there, your voice is your vote - if you care about the future of this island then cast your vote for the candidate that you feel really represents you. Because that way you get the government you deserve. Democracy is there people died to give you the vote. We don't have self appointed MHKs anymore this is the system, please by into the system.

**Martyn Perkins**

Go and vote because if you don't I don't think you should moan about in government if you if you select the MHK that you feel would represent you best go and vote for them. It will depend on your future whether you vote or not.

**Andrew Smith**

Vote for the person that you believe can bring deliver what they say.

**Jamie Smith**

Yeah, vote for the person that not just suits your agenda best but you think suits the whole population best. If you don't vote you can't complain and you're very lucky to have five very good candidates here and hopefully will make the right choice.

**Gareth Young**

For me it's all about having your say democracy is all about you being able to go outside and have your own voice and by electing an MHK and a candidate from us five, you give a voice in parliament that you voted for. Tomorrow night Manx Radio is going to be live at Peel Golf Club, will be talking to the candidates standing in Glenfaba and Peel. On Monday it's going to be a busy one where at the Mitre in Ramsey, next Wednesday will be at Douglas rugby club for the Middle constituency. We will be an Ocean Views in Onchen on the Thursday, will be in Rushen in Port Erin on the Monday after that. The Tuesday, the day before the day before the election, the 21st will be at seven kingdoms in Douglas for Douglas central. Ladies and gentlemen, tonight you've been listening to the candidates for God if you've heard Daphne Caine Martyn Perkins, Andrew Smith, Jamie Smith and Gareth Young. All I'd say to you is please in two weeks time, at about this time, please don't say I wish I voted - that because you need to make your mark well before then. And remember you do have two votes, so think very carefully and please vote in two week’s time. Thanks to our team here at the Shore in Laxey and thanks to Andrea for all the help and our two guests Simon and Lesley from Northampton - thank you as well!